

**TRANSDISCIPLINARY POLICY IN HANDLING
COVID-19 IN INDONESIA: A COMPARATIVE
STUDY ON THE THOUGHT OF KUNTOWIJOYO,
M. AMIN ABDULLAH AND YUDIAN WAHYUDI**

*Waryani Fajar Riyanto**, *Saefudin***, *Harsya Denny
Suryo****

*Faculty of Ushuluddin and Islamic Thought. Sunan
Kalijaga State Islamic University. 55281. Yogyakarta.
Indonesia.

**Faculty of Tarbiyah and Teacher Training. Prof. K.H.
Saifuddin Zuhri State Islamic University. 53126.
Purwokerto. Indonesia.

***Graduate School of Business Management. Boston
University. 02215. Boston. United States.

Email: *waryani.riyanto@uin-suka.ac.id

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.22452/afkar.sp2022no1.6>

Abstract

This article explains how the Indonesian Government's policies on handling the Covid-19 pandemic. Based on the Presidential Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 82 Year 2020 concerning the Committee on Handling the Corona Virus Disease 2019 (Covid-19) and National Economic Recovery, Indonesia's policy integrated health and economic strategies. The regulation adopted an interdisciplinary strategy moving towards multidisciplinary in handling Covid-19 whereby both were deemed insufficient. The theoretical framework in this study applied Ken Wilber's Universal Integralism or Holonic Integralism. This research employs the method of comparison of thinking. The present study establishes a transdisciplinary policy for handling Covid-19 in Indonesia with four strategies: subjective, objective, intersubjective, and interobjective. The researcher compares Indonesian Muslim thinkers on the four

strategies models, namely Kuntowijoyo representing the subjective and objective strategy model, M. Amin Abdullah representing the intersubjective strategy model, and Yudian Wahyudi representing the inter-objective strategy model. This finding implies that the handling of Covid-19 in Indonesia will be more synergistic and interconnected between all sectors of human life.

Keywords: Transdisciplinary; policy; strategy; Covid-19; subjective; objective; intersubjective; interobjective.

Khulasah

Artikel ini menjelaskan bagaimana asas yang digunakan oleh kerajaan Indonesia dalam menangani pandemik Covid-19. Berdasarkan Peraturan Presiden Republik Indonesia Nombor 82 Tahun 2020, asas yang digunakan oleh Jawatankuasa Pengendali Penyakit Virus Corona (Covid-19) dan Pemulihan Ekonomi Negara adalah dengan menyepadukan strategi kesihatan dan ekonomi. Peraturan tersebut menggunakan strategi antara disiplin ke arah kepelbagaian disiplin dalam mengawal Covid-19. Walau bagaimanapun, kedua-duanya dianggap tidak mencukupi. Konsep teori dalam penyelidikan ini mengaplikasikan 'Integralisme Universal Ken Wilber' atau 'Integralisme Holonik' yang menggunakan kaedah perbandingan pemikiran. Kajian ini telah mewujudkan asas transdisiplin untuk menangani Covid-19 di Indonesia dengan menggunakan empat strategi: subjektif, objektif, intersubjektif dan interobjektif. Penyelidik juga telah membuat perbandingan dengan beberapa tokoh pemikir Muslim Indonesia melalui empat strategi yang berikut: Kuntowijoyo yang mewakili model strategi subjektif dan objektif, M. Amin Abdullah yang mewakili model strategi intersubjektif, dan Yudian Wahyudi yang mewakili model strategi interobjektif. Penemuan ini membayangkan bahawa kawalan Covid-19 di Indonesia akan lebih sinergi dan saling

berkaitan dengan semua sektor kehidupan manusia sejangat.

Kata kunci: Transdisiplin, polisi, strategi; Covid-19; perbandingan; subjektif; objektif; intersubjektif; interobjektif.

Introduction

The Covid-19 pandemic is one of the most effective forms of global¹ disruption in the history of human civilization that has hit all countries in the world, including Indonesia.² At present, the Covid-19 pandemic (*wabā'* or *ṭā'ūn*)³ has not ended with the emergence of a new virus variant called Omicron⁴ which has spread throughout the world including Indonesia. However, this country is one of the countries in the world that has succeeded in controlling Covid-19 significantly with an innovation policy based on a science-mix category that created the complexity of policy enforcement and the emergence of innovative health technology.⁵

¹ Minhaji, Akh, *Agama, Islam, dan Ilmu: Visi dan Tradisi Akademik PTAIN/S* (Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2016), 11.

² Rakhmat, Muhammad Zulfikar & Tarahita, Dikanaya, *Covid-19 di Indonesia: 19 Catatan Pemikiran tentang Covid-19 di Indonesia dari Perspektif Politik, Ekonomi, Sosial dan Hubungan Internasional* (Yogyakarta: UII Press, 2020), 45-50; Dicky Sofjan & Muhammad Wildan eds., *Virus, Manusia, dan Tuhan: Refleksi Lintas Iman tentang Covid-19* (Yogyakarta: ICRS, 2020), 10-20.

³ Al-'Asqalāni, Ibn Hājar., *Badhl al-Mā'un fi Faḍl al-Ṭā'ūn* (Riyadh: Dār al-'Āṣimah, 1991), 24-30.

⁴ Mohiuddin, M. D. & Kasahara, K., "Investigating the Aggressiveness of the Covid-19 Omicron Variant and Suggestions for Possible Treatment Options," *Respiratory Medicine* 191(1) (2022), 2.

⁵ Aminullah, Erman & Erman, Erwiza, "Policy Innovation and Emergence of Innovative Health Technology: The System Dynamics Modelling of Early Covid-19 Handling in Indonesia," *Elsevier: Technology in Society* 66(2) (2021), 1.

Before the Covid-19 pandemic,⁶ the world had experienced several disruptions, ranging from economic disruption in the 2008-2009 global financial crisis, technological disruption through the industrial revolution 4.0, political disruption shown by increasing populist and identity politics, disruption of extreme and radical religious understanding, disruption of science through linear and atomistic understanding, and currently disruption of humanity due to Covid-19.⁷ The post-pandemic will be characterized by several main characteristics, such as increasing state domination, increasingly massive adoption of technology, increasing citizen solidarity, and the development of integrated interdisciplinary relations.⁸

Francis Fukuyama has explained three waves of human history, and in the third wave that is currently occurring, there is a great disruption.⁹ This extraordinary disruption resulted from the harmful effects of the biotechnology revolution.¹⁰ Biotechnology is a branch of biology that studies the use of living things (bacteria and viruses) and the products of living things (enzymes,

⁶ World Health Organization (WHO) announced that "the Coronavirus that is currently spreading can be categorized as a global pandemic." This statement was announced by Director General Tedros Adhanom Ghebreyesus at a press conference which took place on March 11, 2020. *Kompas*, March 12, 2020.

⁷ Zhang, Y., et al., "Topic Evolution, Disruption, and Resilience in Early Covid-19 Research," *Springer: Scientometrics* 126(1) (2021), 4242.

⁸ Prasetyantoko, A. "Pandemi, Resesi dan Masa Depan Peradaban". In *Indonesia Menghadapi Pandemi: Kajian Multidisiplin Dampak Covid-19 pada Peradaban*, ed. Prasetyantoko, A. & Suryahudaya, Edbert G. (Jakarta: Kompas, 2020), 1.

⁹ Fukuyama, F., *The Great Disruption: Human Nature and the Reconstruction of Social Order* (New York: The Free Press, 1999), 3-5.

¹⁰ Fukuyama, F., *Our Posthuman Future: Consequences of the Biotechnology Revolution* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2002), 204-205.

alcohol, antibiotics, and organic acids) in the production process to produce goods and services that humans can use.¹¹ If misused as a biological weapon,¹² viruses can destroy the global order. On the other hand, the third wave resulted from severe disturbances to social values held by the community and increasing statistics on crime and extremism.

Likewise, the biotechnology revolution has threatened the lives of humankind through terror bombs that take advantage of inventions in biotechnology. According to Fukuyama, to prevent further destruction of humankind, a collaborative commission consisting of scientists, religious leaders, historians, and biotechnology experts is needed, with the main task of examining the moral and social implications of the research results in this biotechnology field.¹³ In other words, to deal with the disruption caused by bio-technology (Covid-19), Fukuyama wants collaboration between scientists and religious leaders in a trans disciplinary manner.¹⁴ The Covid-19 pandemic is a momentum for all of us to reopen the relationship between religion (religious community as *pesantren*¹⁵) and science.¹⁶

¹¹ Wardani, Agustin K., *Pengantar Bioteknologi* (Jakarta: UB Press, 2020), 3.

¹² Lippi, G., et al., "Covid-19: Unravelling the Clinical Progression of Nature's Virtually Perfect Biological Weapon," *Ann Transl Med* 8(11) (2020), 693.

¹³ Fukuyama, F., *Our Posthuman Future*, 204-205.

¹⁴ Moki, Vladimir S. & Lukyanova, Tatiana A., "Covid-19: Systems Transdisciplinary Generalization, Technical and Technological Ideas, and Solutions," *Informing Science: The International Journal of an Emerging Transdiscipline* 25(2) (2022), 2.

¹⁵ See, Syarif, Z., et al., "Responses of Pesantrens in Madura Towards the Covid-19 Pandemic," *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 15(1) (2021), 45; 'Ulwān, 'Abd Allāh Nāsīh, *Tarbiyyah al-Awlād fī al-Islām* (Solo: Insan Kamil Press, 2012), 5.

¹⁶ Barbour, Ian G., *When Science Meets Religion: Enemies, Strangers or Partners?* (San Francisco: Harper, 2000), 23.

In line with this integrative spirit, President Joko Widodo has issued Presidential Regulation Number 82 of 2020 concerning the Committee for Handling Covid-19 and National Economic Recovery on July 10, 2020.¹⁷ This Presidential Regulation aims to integrate and unify various measures and government policies in handling Covid-19.¹⁸ However, in viewing the regulations at a glance, the government, as national policy, only integrates two fields (interdisciplinary), namely the health sector as the "brake" and the economy as "throttle."¹⁹ In managing the Covid-19 crisis, "throttle" and "brake" must be balanced.²⁰

In a critical situation both at the national and global policy level, citizens must avoid and prevent the spread of the Covid-19 pandemic outbreak. There was an urgent need for medical, pharmaceutical, health and nursing science assistance. It was necessary to prioritize more progressive-integrative religious and scientific thinking

¹⁷ The following are some government policies related to handling Covid-19. First, the formation of a Covid-19 Handling Task Force (Presidential Decree Number 7 of 2020). Second, the Establishment of Large-Scale Social Restrictions (Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 21 of 2020). Third, Determination of Public Health Emergencies (Presidential Decree Number 11 of 2020). Fourth, Government Regulation of Financial Policy for Handling Covid-19. Fifth, Refocusing the 2020 State Budget for Handling Pandemics (Presidential Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 54 of 2020). Sixth, Law Enforcement of Health Protocol Discipline (Presidential Instruction of the Republic of Indonesia Number 6 of 2020). Seventh, the Formation of the Committee for Handling Covid-19 and Presidential Regulation Number 82 of 2020.

¹⁸ Abdul Halim, *Hukum Kesehatan dan Inkonsistensi Kebijakan* (Yogyakarta: Kreasi Total Media, 2020), 158-159; Abdul Halim, *Mismanajemen Kebijakan Kesehatan di Tengah Pandemi* (Yogyakarta: Kreasi Total Media, 2020), 123-130.

¹⁹ Presidential Regulation Number 82 of 2020 concerning the Committee for Handling Covid-19 and National Economic Recovery in part point c which states that "Handling Covid-19 and national economic recovery must be carried out in a single strategic policy unit, which is integrated and cannot be separated."

²⁰ President Joko Widodo, *Kompas.com*, July 21, 2020.

with the spirit of human solidarity and cooperation. Thus, if science alone has to work together, humans, especially scientists, religious leaders, rulers and all elements of society, must unite and work together to face Covid-19. Once again, the Covid-19 pandemic requires collaboration and integration between various disciplines to break the ice and the complexities of life.²¹

One of the ideal models of collaboration between religious people and scientists in unravelling and dealing with the impact of Covid-19 is Universal Integralism or Holonic Integralism,²² by Ken Wilber.²³ Wilber offers an Integral Theory or Integral Approach model, which is realized with the concept of All-Quadrant, All-Level (AQAL).²⁴ AQAL is a rectangular quadrant model (top right, top left, bottom right, bottom left) derived from the concept of The Big Three with the three (3) zones, namely "I" (zone of subjectivity), "We" (zone of intersubjectivity) and "It(s)" (zone of objectivity). Zone "It(s)" is divided into two zones, namely 'It' (zone of objectivity) and 'It(s)' (zone of interobjectivity).²⁵

The upper left quadrant deals with subjectivity, which is a topic for Western psychology and Eastern mysticism, and the upper right quadrant deals with objectivity, which is a topic for sciences and natural sciences. The lower left quadrant is related to intersubjectivity, which is the topic of discussion on

²¹ Abdullah, M. Amin, *Multidisiplin, Interdisiplin, dan Transdisiplin: Metode Studi Agama dan Studi Islam di Era Kontemporer* (Yogyakarta: IB Pustaka, 2021), 324.

²² Wilber, K., *The Marriage of Sense and Soul: Integrating Science and Religion* (Boston: Shambala Publications, 1998), 20-30.

²³ Jakonen, JP., *Ken Wilber as A Spiritual Innovator Studies in Integral Theory* (Finland: University of Turku, 2020), 59.

²⁴ Clayton, P., ed., *Toward A Comprehensive Integration of Science and Religion: A Post-Metaphysical Approach* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006), 541-542.

²⁵ Wilber, K., *The Marriage of Sense and Soul*, 53-54.

humanities and culture. Meanwhile, the lower right quadrant concerns objectivity, which studies the combination of objects that Ken Wilber calls "technological society."²⁶ Thus, there are four scientific quadrants, namely natural sciences or science (top right), religious sciences (top left), cultural sciences or philosophy (bottom left) and engineering sciences or technology (bottom right).²⁷ In the case of handling Covid-19 in Indonesia with the concept of "throttle" and "brake," the economy is in the area of interobjectivity, while health is in the area of objectivity. The dimensions of subjectivity (religion) and intersubjectivity (conscience, social solidarity, cooperation) must also be filled.

Based on these four quadrants, the researcher will place Kuntowijoyo in the subjective-objective quadrant, M. Amin Abdullah in the intersubjective quadrant and Yudian Wahyudi in the interobjective quadrant. The implication is offering an integrative scientific strategy from the interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary²⁸ models that the government has carried out in a transdisciplinary direction. Interdisciplinary is a cooperative relationship between two types of scientific disciplines, each of which

²⁶ Heikkurinen, P. & Ruuska, T., *Sustainability Beyond Technology: Philosophy, Critique, and Implication for Human Organization* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2021), 254-279.

²⁷ Wilber, *The Marriage of Sense and Soul*, 53-54.

²⁸ Most of the studies on Covid-19 still use an interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary approach. For example, Yousfi, N., et al., "The Covid-19 Pandemic: How to Maintain a Healthy Immune System During the Lockdown: A Multidisciplinary Approach with Special Focus on Athletes," *Journal of Biology of Sport* 37(3) (2020), 211; O'Brien, H., et al., "An Integrated Multidisciplinary Model of Covid-19 Recovery Care," *Irish Journal of Medical Science* 1(7) (2020), 27; Simeon, J. O., et al., "Effect of the Demographic of Covid-19 on Different Countries: Using the USA for Comparism," *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Analysis* 4(2) (2021), 193; Baxt, R., et al., "Covid-19: Opportunities for Interdisciplinary Research to Improve Care for Older People in Sweden," *Scandinavian Journal of Public Health* 1(2) (2021), 29.

maintains its methodology,²⁹ for example, the relationship between economics and health sciences. Sometimes, interdisciplinarity is a collaboration between one science and another. It is a unit with a different method (for example, socio-economic, socio-medical and economic-medical).³⁰ Multidisciplinary is an interconnection between three or more types of science.³¹ Still, each of them works based on their respective disciplines and methods. Transdisciplinarity involves various approaches that can break the ice and saturation of independent scientific disciplines and soften rigid boundaries between multiple disciplines. Transdisciplinary thinking and research apply the knowledge resulting from the combination of several elements from various disciplines, including non-disciplinary knowledge, or relevant stakeholders, creating a new, more comprehensive and synthesized knowledge that spans many fields.³²

Kuntowijoyo, M. Amin Abdullah and Yudian Wahyudi

It is fascinating to compare the thoughts of Kuntowijoyo (Kunto), M. Amin Abdullah (Amin) and Yudian Wahyudi (Yudian) regarding the idea of integrating knowledge and its impact on the strategy for handling Covid-19 in Indonesia. Kunto departed from the social sciences (Social

²⁹ Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia, *Pedoman Implementasi Integrasi Ilmu di Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam* (Jakarta: Kementerian Agama, 2019), 32.

³⁰ Kaelan, *Metode Penelitian Agama Kualitatif Interdisipliner: Metode Penelitian Ilmu Agama Interkonektif Interdisipliner dengan Ilmu Lain* (Yogyakarta: Paradigma, 2010), 20-21.

³¹ Humām, Muḥammad, *Tadākhul al-Ma 'ārif wa Nihāyat al-Takhaṣṣuṣ fī al-Fikr al-Islāmī al-'Arabī* (Cairo: Dirāsah fī 'Alaqāt bayn al-'Ulūm, 2017), 4.

³² Klein, J. T., "Guiding Questions for Integration", *Integration Symposium 2004-Proceeding* (Canberra, Australia: Land and Water, 2008), 11.

Prophetic Sciences),³³ Amin from the religious sciences³⁴ and Yudian from the natural sciences to integrate religion and science.³⁵ Kunto is a writer cum scientist,³⁶ Amin is a cleric cum scientist³⁷ and Yudian is called a "21st-century mujtahid" by Saidurrahman.³⁸ The configuration of the three figures has been discussed by Kersten, each of whom represents the fields of the philosophy of social sciences (history), Islamic education and Islamic law.³⁹

Unlike Kunto and Amin, Yudian initiated the integration of knowledge from the natural sciences. According to Yudian, science or natural sciences - not from the socio-humanities and religious sciences - must initiate the integration of knowledge.⁴⁰ In Indonesia, scientific integration at universities occurs in the Faculty of Science and Technology, the Faculty of Public Health, and the Faculty of Medicine. It is in this faculty that the religious and scientific sciences meet. This kind of

³³ See, Adin, et al., "Preliminary Study of Kuntowijoyo Student Value Assessment Instruments (High School Case Study)," *Indonesian Journal of Education and Learning* 4(2) (2021), 502.

³⁴ See, Jainul Arifin, "Teologi Humanis dalam Pemikiran M. Amin Abdullah," *Jurnal Refleksi* 20(2) (2020), 119.

³⁵ See, Anam, Khairul, *Salam Pancasila Sebagai Salam Kebangsaan: Memahami Pemikiran Kepala Badan Pembinaan Ideologi Pancasila Yudian Wahyudi* (Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2021), 11.

³⁶ Wan Anwar, *Kuntowijoyo: Karya dan Duniannya* (Jakarta: Grasindo, 2007), vii. Kuntowijoyo is one of the few Indonesian writers as well as academics who are able to write literary works and scientific works equally well.

³⁷ Setiawan, Iwan, "Pemikiran M. Amin Abdullah: Menuju Pendekatan Keilmuan dari Integratif ke Interkonektif," *Hermeneia: Jurnal Kajian Islam Interdisipliner* 5(2) (2006), 381.

³⁸ Saidurrahman, "Bedah Buku: Mengenal Lebih Dekat Sosok dan Pemikiran Kepala BPIP", Yogyakarta, UIN Sunan Kalijaga, March 12, 2021.

³⁹ Kersten, C., *Islam in Indonesia: The Contest for Society, Ideas, and Values* (London: Hurst & Company, 2015), 177-188.

⁴⁰ Saidurrahman & Tarigan, Azhari Akmal, *Rekonstruksi Peradaban Islam Perspektif Prof. K.H. Yudian Wahyudi, Ph.D* (Jakarta: Prenada Media Group, 2019), 171-173.

integration cannot be carried out directly at the undergraduate level but must be started from the high school level as *madrasah*.⁴¹ Thus, the focus of scientific integration is in the fields of science and technology. Therefore, in Yudian's view, the problem of this *ummah*⁴² is not the integration of religion and social science, but religion and natural science in the sense of returning experimental sciences to Indonesian Islamic education, starting from primary education, at least at the first level until bachelor's, master's and even doctoral degree.⁴³

Kunto, Amin and Yudian have similarities and differences, but they were all *santris*. Kunto was born to a father whose grandfather was 'Javanese santri' named H. Abdul Wahid Sosroatmojo in Yogyakarta on September 18, 1943.⁴⁴ Kunto inherited two cultural hues, namely the 'masculine' Yogyakarta and the 'feminine' Surakarta cultures. These two cultural features shape his character as a scientist and an artist. Amin was born to an 'Arab santri' father named H. Ahmad Abdullah in Pati, Central Java, on July 29, 1953. H. Ahmad Abdullah had lived in Makkah for 18 years. Living in an Islamic boarding school environment, Amin then went to school at "Pondok Modern Gontor". So, two cultures characterize Amin, namely traditionalist-modernist.⁴⁵ Meanwhile, Yudian was born in Balikpapan, East Kalimantan Province on April 17, 1960, and the son of a 'santri-soldier' named Asmin

⁴¹ See, Marwazi et al., "Traditional Madrasah, State Policies and The Rise of Integrated Islamic Schools in Jambi," *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 15(1) (2021), 80.

⁴² Ṭālibī, Muḥammad, *Ummah al-Wasaṭ: Al-Islām wa Taḥaddiyāt al-Mu'āṣirah* (Tunisia: Ceres, 1996), 67-70.

⁴³ Saidurrahman & Azhari, *Rekonstruksi Peradaban Islam*, 171-173.

⁴⁴ M. Fahmi, *Islam Transendental: Menelusuri Jejak-jejak Pemikiran Islam Kuntowijoyo* (Yogyakarta: Pilar Media, 2005), 22.

⁴⁵ Riyanto, Waryani Fajar, *Integrasi-Interkoneksi Keilmuan: Biografi Intelektual M. Amin Abdullah, Person, Knowledge, Institution* (Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2013), 158-159.

Prajabangsa, who was a soldier during the revolutionary era of General Sudirman. Yudian had studied in Tremas and Krapyak Yogyakarta. As a 'santri-soldier' child, Yudian inherited his father's character, who was a spiritualist, intellectualist and nationalist.⁴⁶ Yudian has been appointed by President Joko Widodo as Head of the Pancasila Ideology Development Agency (*Badan Pembinaan Ideologi Pancasila-BPIP*).⁴⁷ On the other hand, Kunto and Amin were once active in Muhammadiyah, while Yudian has been active in Nahdlatul Ulama.

Kunto, Amin and Yudian have pursued postgraduate degrees in the West, and all three follow the study of philosophy. Kunto studied historical philosophy, Amin followed Islamic philosophy and religion, and Yudian in Islamic legal philosophy. Kunto graduated from Columbia University in the United States, Amin from the Department of Philosophy Middle East Technical University (METU) in Turkey⁴⁸ and Yudian from McGill University, Canada. Kunto earned a Master's degree (1973) from The University of Connecticut, USA in American Studies and a Doctorate (1980) from Colombia University with a history-related dissertation entitled *Social Change in an Agrarian Society: Madura, 1850-1940*.⁴⁹ Amin wrote a dissertation entitled *The Idea of*

⁴⁶ Riyanto, Waryani Fajar, *Universalitas Pancasila Yudian Wahyudi: Percikan Biografi Intelektual, Spiritual and Internasional* (Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2021), 44.

⁴⁷ Anam, Khoirul, ed., *Mengenal Lebih Dekat Sosok dan Pemikiran Kepala Badan Pembinaan Ideologi Pancasila Republik Indonesia: Prof. Drs. K.H. Yudian Wahyudi, M.A., Ph.D* (Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2021), 45.

⁴⁸ Machmudi, Yon, et al., "Turkish Laicism in Indonesia's Newspapers (1920-1940) and Its Influence on Indonesian Secularists and Muslims Thoughts," *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 15(1) (2021), 12.

⁴⁹ Zainal Abidin, Muhammad, *Paradigma Islam Dalam Pembangunan Ilmu Integralistik: Membaca Pemikiran Kuntowijoyo* (Banjarmasin: IAIN Antasari Press 2016), 72. Kunto's dissertation has been

Universality of Ethical Norms in al-Ghazālī and Kant (1990), which was later translated into the German language.⁵⁰ Amin's dissertation compared two philosophers, namely al-Ghazālī⁵¹ in Iran and Immanuel Kant in Germany.

In contrast to Amin, Yudian wrote a thesis on Indonesian Islamic Jurisprudence,⁵² exploring contemporary Islamic philosophical thought by comparing three figures in his dissertation, namely Hasan Ḥanafī⁵³ in Egypt, Muḥammad Jābirī⁵⁴ in Morocco and Nurcholish Madjid in Indonesia.⁵⁵ Still related to comparative studies, Yudian had compared Ali Shari'ati and Bint Syati's

translated by Machmoed Effendhie and Punang AmariPuja entitled *Perubahan Sosial Dalam Masyarakat Agraris Madura 1850-1940* (Yogyakarta: Matabangsa, 2002).

⁵⁰ Abdullah, M. Amin, "The Idea of Universality of Ethical Norms in Al-Ghazālī and Kant," *Dissertation* (Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı, 1992). This dissertation has been translated into German by Yakut, A. entitled *Universalität Des Ethik Kant & Al-Ghazālī* (Frankfurt: Verlag Y. Landeck, 2003) and into Indonesian entitled *Antara Al-Ghazālī & Kant: Filsafat Etika Islam* (Bandung: Mizan, 2002).

⁵¹ See, Sibawaihi, "Epistemologizing the Islamic Concept of Resurrection in the Hereafter: A Comparative Study between al-Ghazālī and Fazlur Rahman," *Afkar: Journal of Aqidah & Islamic Thought* 23(2) (2021), 280-285.

⁵² Wahyudi, Yudian, "Hasbi's Theory of *Ijtihad* in the Context of Indonesian Fiqh", Thesis, Montreal: Institute of Islamic Studies, 1993.

⁵³ Ḥanafī, Ḥassan, *al-Turāth wa al-Tajdīd: Mawqifunā min al-Turāth al-Qadīm* (Cairo: Al-Markāz al-'Arabī al-Baḥth wa al-Nashr, 1980), 12-20.

⁵⁴ Al-Jābirī, Muḥammad 'Ābid, *Al-Turāth wa al-Hadatha: Dirāsāt wa Munāqashāt* (Beirut: Markāz Dirāsāt al-Waḥdah al-'Arabīyyah, 1991), 23-25.

⁵⁵ Wahyudi, Yudian, "The Slogan 'Back to the Qur'an and the Sunna': A Comparative Study of the Responses of Hasan Hanafī, Muhammad 'Abid al-Jābirī and Nurcholish Madjid" (Doctoral thesis, The Institute of Islamic Studies, McGill University, Montreal, Canada, 2002).

thoughts⁵⁶ and compared their thoughts with Nurcholish Madjid.⁵⁷ Yudian's article was later translated into Turkish by Necdet Subasi with title *Özgür İrade Meselesinde Ali Şeriatı ve Bint'uş-Şati'*. Thus, the integration between religion and science necessitates the emergence of a comparative model in handling Covid-19 through philosophical links.

Through Kunto, Amin and Yudian, we learn about the importance of philosophy as a connecting pillar between religion and science, which is in line with what Barbour has expressed:

Scientist and theologians have usually tried to relate science directly to religion, neglecting the contribution philosophy can make to clarifying issues. On the other hand, professional philosophers have often had little contact with either the scientific or the religious community. Their abstract formulations sometimes bear little resemblance to what scientists and theologians are doing. The point of departure for the philosophy of religion must be the worshiping community and its theological ideas; only then can philosophy serve as a function to both the critical and relevant to religion. Similarly, philosophy of science must be the basis for the actual practice of scientific work.⁵⁸

Kunto, Amin and Yudian are professors in philosophy. Kunto is a professor of historical philosophy,

⁵⁶ Wahyudi, Yudian, "Ali Shari'atī and Bint al-Shatī' on Free Will: A Comparison", *Journal of Islamic Studies* 9(1) (1998), 35.

⁵⁷ Supriatman, Yan Yan, "Pendidikan Pesantren Menurut Cak Nur dan Yudian Wahyudi", *Tajdid: Jurnal Pemikiran Keislaman dan Kemanusiaan* 1(1) (2017), 17.

⁵⁸ Barbour, Ian G., *Issues in Science and Religion* (New York: Harper Torchbooks, 1966), 11.

Amin is a professor of the philosophy of religion and Yudian is a professor of Islamic legal philosophy. Utilizing a historical-philosophical approach, Kunto divides the historical periodization of the religious consciousness of Indonesian Muslims into three stages: myth, ideology and science.⁵⁹ The period of science was marked by the emergence of professionals who were members of the Indonesian Muslim Intellectuals Association (*Ikatan Cendekiawan Muslim Indonesia*). During this period, the need for Islam to be an objective religion (for anyone, regardless of their predicate in seeing something as truth, regardless of personal beliefs) became increasingly significant. The results of this period were at least in four fields, namely Islamic economics, Islamic psychology, and its application, practical politics and religious thought.

Kunto has offered a trilogy model for the historical awareness of Muslims in Indonesia, namely myth, ideology and science. As for Amin, who is now the Chair of the Indonesian Academy of Sciences (*Akademi Ilmu Pengetahuan Indonesia*) in Cultural Commission, has offered a trilogy of interconnective religious approaches, namely, doctrinal-theological, cultural-sociological and fundamental-critical-inclusive approaches.⁶⁰ Amin describes the meeting between the three as a 'flashlight' having three batteries. The three batteries are three scientific clusters in the field of religion in a dialogical-critical relationship pattern between sciences based on

⁵⁹ Kuntowijoyo, "Periodisasi Sejarah Kesadaran Keagamaan Umat Islam Indonesia: Mitos, Ideologi, dan Ilmu," Pidato Pengukuhan Jabatan Guru Besar Ilmu Sejarah, Fakultas Ilmu Budaya Universitas Gadjah Mada, on July 21, 2001, 16.

⁶⁰ Abdullah, M. Amin, "Rekonstruksi Metodologi Studi Agama-Agama Dalam Masyarakat Multikultural dan Multireligius," *Inauguration Speech for a Professor of Philosophy*, delivered in front of the Open Senate Meeting of Institut Agama Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, May 13, 2000, 35.

religious texts (*naqlī*; *bayānī*, subjective), sciences based on the accuracy of the mind in understanding the sociological-anthropological reality of the development of religious life in the era of cultural and religious plurality (*'aqlī*, *burhānī*, objective), and sciences that are more in touch with the human conscience (*qalbī*, *'irfānī*, intuitive, intersubjective Sufism).⁶¹ This relationship pattern is one of the many ways for consideration in the reconstruction effort. In the sense of handling Covid-19 in Indonesia, the transdisciplinary integration of the three approaches can be applied as doctrinal-theological (Covid-19, religious and interfaith perspective),⁶² cultural-sociological (Covid-19, scientific perspective, humanities, society and state),⁶³ and fundamental-critical-inclusive (Covid-19 in global ethical perspective).⁶⁴

Meanwhile, according to Yudian, the correct meaning of the jargon "Returning to the Qur'an and Sunnah" is to realize *tawhīd al-'ulūm*, namely unity of knowledge: *Qawliyyah* verses, *Kawniyyah* verses and

⁶¹ Al-Jābirī, Muḥammad 'Ābid, *Takwīn al-'Aql al-'Arabī* (Beirut: al-Markāz al-Thaqāfī al-'Arabī, 1990), 11-12; al-Jābirī, Muḥammad 'Ābid, *Bunyah al-'Aql al-'Arabī: Dirāsah Taḥlīliyyah Naqdiyyah li Nazm al-Ma'rifah fī al-Thaqāfah al-'Arābiyyah* (Beirut: Markāz Dirāsah al-Wiḥdah al-Murābiyyah, 1986), 45; Utomo, Sigit Tri & Mu'anayah, Nur Alfi, "Epistemology of Islamic Education Al-Jabiri Perspective of the Conservative, Modernist, Neo Modernist Flow and Burhani-Bayani-Irfani," *International Journal Ihya' Ulum Al-Din* 22(2) (2020), 162.

⁶² See Dein, S., et al., "Covid-19, Mental Health and Religion: An Agenda for Future Research Mental Health," *Religion & Culture* 23(1) (2020), 2.

⁶³ See Quigley, M. C., et al., "A Multi Hazards Earth Science Perspective on the Covid-19 Pandemic: The Potential for Concurrent and Cascading Crises," *Environment Systems and Decisions* 40(1) (2020), 199.

⁶⁴ See, Robinson, F., "Global Health and the Covid-19 Pandemic: A Care Ethics Approach," *Journal of Global Ethics* 1(2) (2021), 4.

Insāniyyah verses.⁶⁵ The *Qawliyyah* verses are signs of the greatness of Allah in the Qur'an (and the *Ṣaḥīḥ Ḥadīth*). Among the most important laws here are *Tawḥīd*, Morals, and Justice. The *Kawniyyah* verses are signs of Allah's greatness in the universe. The most important sign of Allah's greatness here is the law of positive and negative pairing. Islam at the natural level is capable of balancing negative and positive potentials. Islam here can be drawn to maximize potential and minimize negative potential. The *Kawniyyah* verses are the signs of the greatness of Allah, who governs human life (cosmic). The most important law here is social justice and mutual agreement. Thus, *Tawḥīd*⁶⁶ is to integrate the will of Allah as written in the Holy Book (the Qur'an) with nature and humans so that they are free from theological, cosmos and cosmic disasters. The act of applying *tawḥīd* is called '*taqwā*,' the peak of which is '*ihsān*' (consciousness to present God anywhere and anytime at the theological, cosmos and cosmic levels).⁶⁷

The typology of myths, ideology and science that Kunto has initiated⁶⁸ can be complemented by subjective (*naqlī; bayānī*), objective (*'aqlī, burhānī*), and

⁶⁵ Iqbal, Moch & Adisel, "Epistemology of Islamic Science: A Searching for Ideal Form and Format of Scientific Design for Islamic Higher Education in Indonesia," *Madania* 25(1) (2021), 105.

⁶⁶ Muhammad 'Abduh, *Risālah al-Tawḥīd* (Cairo: Al-Manār, 1926), 45-50.

⁶⁷ Wahyudi, Yudian, "Islam dan Nasionalisme: Sebuah Pendekatan *Maqashid Syari'ah*," Teks Pidato Ilmiah Dies Natalis UIN Sunan Kalijaga, September 23, 2006, 34.

⁶⁸ Novita Sari & Taat Wulandar, "Grounding the Teachings of Kuntowijoyo as a Prophetic Social Science as an Effort to Counteract Radicalism in Indonesia," *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research*, 398: 2nd International Conference on Social Science and Character Educations (ICoSSCE 2019), Atlantis Press, 224-228.

intersubjective⁶⁹ (*qalbī, 'irfānī*) models from Amin⁷⁰ in viewing the handling of Covid-19 in Indonesia in a more integrative-interdisciplinary way. The ideological period is subjective and science is objective. The researchers have included the period of 'integrative science' after the period of science. The integrative science should give birth to intersubjective attitudes. The integration model of science can be filled with the model of *tawhīd al-'ulūm* by Yudian, namely integrating theological, cosmos and cosmic verses. In this context, Covid-19 as a cosmic disaster can be read and understood through the four processes of the journey of awareness in the history of Covid-19 in Indonesia, namely myth, ideology, science and integrative science.

In the mythological awareness, some people in Indonesia interpret Covid-19 as a form of "evil spirit."⁷¹ The evil spirit (Covid-19) will disappear with a sign of the emergence of a hot cloud-like "*Semar*", which indicates the disaster (*pagebluk*) that is currently sweeping the world, and the entire archipelago is starting to end.⁷² The awareness of the Indonesian people has then shifted towards ideology, which results into a conspiracy theory caused Covid-19.⁷³ Conspiracy theorists devise

⁶⁹Mascolo, Michael F. & Kallio, E., "The Phenomenology of Between: An Intersubjective Epistemology for Psychological Science," *Journal of Constructivist Psychology* 33(1) (2020), 10.

⁷⁰ Abdullah, M. Amin, "The Intersubjective Type of Religiosity: Theoretical Framework and Methodological Construction for Developing Human Sciences in a Progressive Muslim Perspective," *Al-Jāmi'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies* 58(1) (2020), 63.

⁷¹ Leonardi, M., et al., "Avoiding the Banality of Evil in Times of Covid-19: Thinking Differently with a Biopsychosocial Perspective for Future Health and Social Policies Development," *SN Comprehensive Clinical Medicine* 2(1) (2020), 1758.

⁷² Bramastia, "Rasionalisasi Mitologi Covid-19", *Suara Merdeka Solo*, May 12, 2020.

⁷³ Shahsavari, S., et al., "Conspiracy in the Time of Corona: Automatic Detection of Emerging Covid-19 Conspiracy Theories in Social

pseudoscience (knowledge or belief that is claimed to be scientific but does not follow the scientific method), described as a counter to rational scholarship.

Today, Indonesian society is in a rational and scientific awareness, which is marked by adherence to health protocols and following vaccination programs.⁷⁴ The starting period of awareness towards integrative science in handling Covid-19 is indicated by the emergence of interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary cooperation carried out by the government in taking integrated policies by involving various aspects of life, such as health, economy, education and socio-culture.⁷⁵ As a cosmic disaster, Covid-19 can be resolved by strengthening the *Qawliyyah* pillars (by increasing the "faith" of each adherent of religions), *Nafsiyyah* pillars (by increasing collaboration between the government with test, treat and trace, and the community with use masks, hand washing, physical distance and away from crowds to

Media and the News," *Journal of Computational Social Science* 3(2) (2020), 279; Pranita, Ellyvon, "Setahun Pandemi Covid-19: Enam Teori Konspirasi Menyesatkan Dunia," *Kompas*, March 2, 2021. The six Covid-19 Conspiracy Theories are: 1. The theory of leakage of the biological laboratory in Wuhan, China. 2. The theory of 5G technology. 3. The theory of vaccine microchip implantation. 4. Conspiracy theories from the government. 5. The theory of the claim by the world doctors' alliance that Covid-19 does not exist. 6. Plandemic theory by Judy Mikovits. Judy has moved a documentary video that Covid-19 was made by a large pharmaceutical company.

⁷⁴ Ita, Kevin, "Coronavirus Disease (Covid-19): Current Status and Prospects for Drug and Vaccine Development," *Archives of Medical Research* 52(2) (2021), 17. The implementation of the Covid-19 vaccination began on January 13, 2021 with the first vaccination carried out on the President of the Republic of Indonesia Joko Widodo, as well as a number of representatives from various backgrounds such as health workers, religious leaders, teachers and others.

⁷⁵ Ni'mawati et al., "Kajian Riset Monodisipliner dan Interdisipliner dalam Pendidikan Islam Menghadapi Isu Nasional dan Global: Studi Kasus Terhadap Isu Covid-19," *Misykāt* 5(1) (2020), 102.

be 'safe'), and *Kawniyyah* pillars (by massively increasing the vaccination program to increase immunity).⁷⁶

According to Yudian, with harmony, no military technology is needed to fight Covid-19. What is needed is a return to the constitution. As for the concern of Covid-19, it is a return to health protocols. In comparison, following medical protocols are tantamount to the great *jihād*.⁷⁷ Through "guyūb rukun" and "jihād akbar," we will succeed in returning to normalcy, back to the origins. In fighting Covid-19, what is needed now is not mutual blame but a spirit of unity, mutual help and mutual cooperation based on Pancasila values.⁷⁸ In facing the conditions of a new world war, namely the medical war against Covid-19, military technology was unable to cripple it; resistance could only be carried out if the Indonesian people "worked together with the spirit of Godliness."⁷⁹

⁷⁶ The National Disaster Management Agency (*Badan Nasional Penanggulangan Bencana/BNPB*) on October 16, 2020 said that the Government will disseminate efforts to overcome Covid-19 with the concept of: safe, faith and immunity. In order for the public to be safe from Covid-19, must be done is always adhere to health protocols (maintaining distance, wearing masks, avoiding crowds and washing hands). Faith is, to increase faith and piety to God in each religion. As for immunity, it is so that people increase their immunity (vaccination). *Kompas*, October 18, 2020.

⁷⁷ Sayyid Abū al-A'lā Mawdūdī, *al-Jihād fī al-Islām* (Beirut: Dār al-Fikr, 1988), 45.

⁷⁸ Suryono, Hassan & Utomo, Bkti, "Development of Pancasila Based on Science and Technology in Building a New World Order Era Pandemic Covid-19," *Advances in Social Science, Education, and Humanities Research: Proceedings of the 1st International Conference of Education, Social, and Humanities (INCESH)*, Atlantis Press, 581, 1 (2021), 173.

⁷⁹ Wahyudi, Yudian, "Belajarliah dari Bung Karno dalam Membumikan Pancasila," *News in BPIP*, June 8, 2020.

Universal Integration or Holonic Integration: A Theoretical Framework

To combine religion and science, Kunto uses the term "Humanism-Theocentric". The term is used to denote that there are two kinds of sources of knowledge, namely those of God and other humans.⁸⁰ In Islam, the concept of theocentrism turns out to be humanistic. This means, according to Islam, humans must focus on God, and the goal is for the benefit of humans themselves. Humanism-Theocentric is the core value of all Islamic teachings.⁸¹ Inspired by Kunto, Amin utilizes the term "Teo-Anthropocentric-Integralistic".⁸² In the language of Islamic legal philosophy, Yudian uses the term *Ilāhī-Wad'ī*.⁸³ Based on the law of pairing, Islamic law is divine-*wad'ī*, absolute-relative, universal-local, eternal-temporary, and literal-meaningful.⁸⁴

Kunto uses two methodologies in the process of Islamic science with the Humanism-Theocentric paradigm, namely integralisation and objectification. Integralisation is the integration of human scientific wealth with revelation. The objectification is to make the scientificisation of Islam a blessing for all people.⁸⁵ Amin

⁸⁰ Kuntowijoyo, *Usulan Pendirian Forum Studi Ilmu-ilmu Profetik kepada Universitas Gadjah Mada* (Yogyakarta: n.p, 2002), 8.

⁸¹ Kuntowijoyo, *Paradigma Islam: Interpretasi Untuk Aksi* (Bandung: Mizan, 1992), 229.

⁸² Abdullah, M. Amin, "Etika Tauhidik sebagai Dasar Kesatuan Epistemologi Keilmuan Umum dan Agama: Dari Paradigma Positivistik-Sekularistik ke Arah Teoantroposentrik-Integralistik", in *Menyatukan Kembali Ilmu-ilmu Agama dan Umum: Upaya Mempertemukan Epistemologi Islam dan Umum*, ed. Jarot Wahyudi (Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2003), 3.

⁸³ Al-Shātibī, Abū Ishāq Ibrāhīm, *al-Muwāfaqāt fī Uṣūl al-Sharī'ah* (Beirut: Dār al-Halabī, 1990), 11-23.

⁸⁴ Wahyudi, Yudian, "Maqashid asy-Syari'ah Sebagai Doktrin dan Metode," *Al-Jami'ah Journal* 58(1) (1995), 24.

⁸⁵ Kuntowijoyo, *Islam Sebagai Ilmu: Epistemologi, Metodologi, dan Etika* (Yogyakarta: Tiara Wacana, 2006), 49.

utilizes two approaches, namely integration-interconnection of knowledge⁸⁶ and intersubjectification.⁸⁷ Integration-Interconnection combines the supporting culture of religious science sourced from the text (*ḥaḍārat al-nash*), the culture supporting factual-historical-empirical science, namely social science and natural sciences (*ḥaḍārat al-‘ilm*) and the culture supporting ethical-philosophical science (*ḥaḍārat al-falsafah*).⁸⁸ Intersubjective is a combination of subjective and objective thinking models.⁸⁹ Concurrently, Yudian offers a model of science integration (*tawḥīd al-‘ulūm*)⁹⁰ and interobjectification in the form of Universal Technology.⁹¹ Using Ken Wilber's term, the link between the three authors refers to Universal Integration or Holonic Integration.

Universal Integration or Holonic Integration combines four elements: subjective, objective, intersubjective, and interobjective.⁹² Ken Wilber calls Holonic Integration the "Quadrant-Tetra-Interaction"

⁸⁶ See, Puspitasari, Fantika F., "The Integration-Interconnection Discourse of Islamic Education and Science in Indonesia," *Jurnal Tarbawi* 2(8) (2020), 153.

⁸⁷ See, Brems, L., *Intersubjectivity and Intersubjectification* (London: The Routledge Handbook of Cognitive Linguistics, 2020), 333-343.

⁸⁸ Abdullah, M. Amin, *Islamic Studies di Perguruan Tinggi: Pendekatan Integratif-Interkonektif* (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2006), ix.

⁸⁹ Abdullah, M. Amin, "The Intersubjective Type of Religiosity: Theoretical Framework and Methodological Construction for Developing Human Sciences in a Progressive Muslim Perspective," *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies* 58(1) (2020), 34.

⁹⁰ Wahyudi, Yudian, *Maqashid asy-Syari'ah Dalam Pergumulan Politik: Berfilsafat Hukum Islam dari Harvard ke Sunan Kalijaga* (Yogyakarta: Nawasea Press, 2007), 24.

⁹¹ Wahyudi, Yudian, "Mengapa Ibn Sina Hilang dari Sejarah?" unpublished manuscript.

⁹² Wilber, K. & Bigelow, C., *The Pocket Ken Wilber* (Boston: Shambala, 2008), 103-110.

approach or the "1-2-3" approach.⁹³ The upper right quadrant presents the individual in an objective, empirical and scientific perspective. These include the body's organic structure, biochemistry, neurobiological factors, neuro-transmitters and organic-brain structures (brainstem, limbic system and neocortex). The lower right quadrant focuses on communal exterior areas or systems sciences, systems theory, ecological networks, complexity theory, techno-economic structures, environmental networks and social systems. The two quadrants of the right side (top-bottom) apply an objective approach or use the third person language "It," both of which are considered as scientific areas, whilst individual sciences are in the top right and systems sciences are in the lower right.⁹⁴

The upper left and lower left quadrants focus on the interior quadrant. Theorists and researchers in the upper left quadrant deal with aspects of individual awareness, and produce a series of studies, ranging from psychoanalysis, phenomenology, introspective psychology to meditative consciousness, represented by scientists such as Freud, Jung, Piaget and Buddha. The phenomenal reality in this quadrant is expressed in the first-person language, "I."⁹⁵ The lower left quadrant includes all patterns of consciousness shared by various entities inside a culture or a sub-culture. Values, perceptions, meanings, habitats, cultural practices and various things exchanged simultaneously amongst individuals are called cultural patterns or intersubjective patterns in consciousness. This quadrant is expressed by the terms "We."⁹⁶

⁹³ Visser, F., "Ken Wilber's Problematic Relationship to Science," *Integral Review* 16(2) (2020), 167.

⁹⁴ Wilber, K., *A Theory of Everything: An Integral Vision for Business, Politics, Science and Spirituality* (Boston: Shambala, 2000), 23.

⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, 104.

⁹⁶ Ulanova, A.E., "Ken Wilber's: Integral Spirituality," Book Review (2020), from Ken Wilber, *Integral Spirituality: A Startling New Role*

All four quadrants and their realities interact and evolve. This model is also called "Tetra-Interaction" or "Tetra-Evolution." Sometimes, Wilber simplifies this model by calling it a "1-2-3" approach to the cosmos. This term refers to first, second and third-person realities. The upper left quadrant concerns "I" (first person designation); the bottom left concerns "We" (second person designation); and the second right-sided quadrant correspond to objective patterns as "He/She" (third-person designation). So, the four quadrants can be a simplification developed into the term "Big Three" (I, We, and He/She or "I-We-It[s]"). This "Big Three" dimension can manifest through various aspects. This approach respects all existing waves of existence from the body, mind, soul and spirit, considered unbroken waves in self, culture and nature. More briefly, Wilber calls the model "holonic."⁹⁷

The following is an example of implementing a holonic approach in dealing with the impact of Covid-19 in Indonesia in a transdisciplinary manner. For instance, orthodox or conventional treatment of Covid-19 is a classic approach (upper right quadrant). This method deals almost entirely with the physical aspect using physical interventions: respirators, drugs and medications. This conventional medicine essentially believes in the physical causes of physical illness so that the treatment offered for Covid-19 is primarily physical. However, the holonic model claims that every physical event (upper right quadrant) has four interrelated dimensions (four quadrants). It is not that the upper right quadrant is not

for Religion in the Modern and Postmodern World (Boston: Shambala, 2006), 172-173.

⁹⁷ Aditya, Surya, "Tinjauan Kritis terhadap Integrasi Agama dan Sains: Studi Komparatif antara Ian G. Barbour dan Ken Wilber", Tesis, Fakultas Filsafat Universitas Gadjah Mada Yogyakarta, Indonesia, 2021, 56-60.

essential; it is just that it is only a quarter of the total.⁹⁸ In the aspect of Covid-19 treatment, psycho-neuro-immunology elements are now emerging, which have a crucial role, both as a cause and cure for physical illnesses. In other words, the upper left quadrant is an essential aspect of comprehensive health. Visualization and affirmations have played an essential role in managing most of the Covid-19 diseases, and the results depend on the patient's emotional and mental state.

However, apart from subjective factors in handling the impact of Covid-19, it is no less important that individual consciousness does not exist in a vacuum. It is attached to cultural values, beliefs and world views the way a culture (the lower left quadrant) views Covid-19 patients, either with care and compassion or with blasphemy and rejection. It will significantly affect the way individuals (upper left quadrant) perceive the virus, which will directly impact the practice of handling Covid-19 itself (upper right quadrant). Many definitions of viruses would not be possible without considering the cultural background. The lower left quadrant covers all the intersubjective factors crucial in human interaction, such as communication between doctors and Covid-19 patients, support from family or friends, cultural acceptance or rejection of Covid-19 patients. The factors mentioned above become a cause or cure for Covid-19 patients to a certain degree.

The lower right quadrant focuses on economic and social factors regarding the impact of Covid-19, which have not been considered part of the overall Covid-19 handling entity. This quadrant has a powerful influence, both as a causative factor and a cure for Covid-19. For instance, a social system that cannot distribute respiratory aids and Covid-19 vaccinations evenly will result in more and more people being infected with Covid-19. This

⁹⁸ Wilber, K., *A Theory of Everything*, 186.

quadrant includes factors such as economy, insurance, social systems and even straightforward matters related to handling Covid-19, such as the layout, capacity and availability of hospital rooms for Covid-19 patients (which allow ease of movement and easy access for visitors).⁹⁹

In short, the handling of Covid-19 in Indonesia must include a transdisciplinary manner that covers "all quadrants, at all levels." The idea is simple, that every quadrant or dimension-I, We, It(s)-has a level or wave that is either physical, emotional, mental and spiritual, and Covid-19 patient care will integrally encompass the entirety of that reality. As a result, the integral treatment of Covid-19 patients will become more effective and more efficient. For this reason, organizational medicine today is taking this integral model of medicine seriously.

Transdisciplinary Policy: The Relationship between Several Strategies of Subjective and Objective by Kuntowijoyo, Intersubjective by M. Amin Abdullah, and Interobjective by Yudian Wahyudi for Handling Covid-19 in Indonesia

Handling the impact of Covid-19 in Indonesia must be handled in a transdisciplinary manner by involving four areas; subjective, objective, intersubjective and interobjective strategies. Subjectivity is the movement of reason from science to ideology, which means that one should consider the views of interfaith religious groups towards Covid-19.¹⁰⁰ The problem of Covid-19 must include the understanding from an Islamic perspective in a transdisciplinary manner between the *Jabāriyyah*

⁹⁹ *Ibid.*, 189.

¹⁰⁰ Sofjan, Dicky & Wildan, Muhammad eds., *Virus, Manusia, dan Tuhan: Refleksi Lintas Iman tentang Covid-19* (Yogyakarta: ICRS, 2020), 45-50.

(fatalistic)¹⁰¹ and *Qadāriyyah* (free will)¹⁰² thinking models¹⁰³ or between deductive textual (religionists) and inductive scientific (authoritative institutions).¹⁰⁴ In responding to the Covid-19 pandemic, *Jabāriyyahs*, who have fatalist ideology, view that everything that happens to humans has no cause from humans. *Jabāriyyah's* view even says, "Fear God, not Corona!"¹⁰⁵ In contrast to *Jabāriyyah*, the *Qadāriyyahs* see God giving space for freedom and strength (*qudrat*) to humans not to be infected by Covid-19 through human efforts. If a human is infected by the virus, it is not God's will but rather by the carelessness of the human being himself.

To integrate the religious views of *Jabāriyyah-Qadāriyyah*¹⁰⁶ related to Covid-19, we may use Yudian thinking about *Tawḥīd*.¹⁰⁷ *Tawḥīd* is the harmony between theological, cosmos and cosmic aspects. The essence of harmony at the cosmos and cosmic levels is maximizing positive potentials and minimizing negative

¹⁰¹ See, Nageeb, S., et al., "Adapting a Religious Health Fatalism Measure for Use in Muslim Populations," *Plos One* 2(1) (2018), 11.

¹⁰² See, Salmani, A. & Poornamdarian, T., "Determinism and Free Will from the Point of View of Theology and Mysticism," *Gawhar-Guya* 15(1) (2021), 12.

¹⁰³ See, Wahyudi, Yudian, "Ali Shari'ati and Bint al-Shati' on Free Will: A Comparison," *Journal of Islamic Studies* 9(1) (1998), 10.

¹⁰⁴ Hilmy, Masdar & Khoirun Niam, "Winning the Battle of Authorities: The Muslim Disputes Over the Covid-19 Pandemic Plague in Contemporary Indonesia," *Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies (QIJIS)* 8(2) (2020), 320.

¹⁰⁵ Fathurahman, Oman, "Jangan Takut Corona, Takutlah pada Tuhan: Disebut Justru Tak Sesuai Ajaran Rasul," *Antara News.Com*, May 13, 2020.

¹⁰⁶ Shahrastānī, *al-Milāl wa al-Nihāl* (Beirut: Dār al-Fikr al-'Arabī, 1997), 23-25.

¹⁰⁷ See, Hutapea, Riski Munandar, et al., "Exploring the Strategies of Teachers to Integrate *Tauhid* in Teaching Science and History in Selangor, Malaysia," *International Journal of Social Learning* 1(2) (2021), 89.

possibilities.¹⁰⁸ Because every object (including viruses) must have negative and positive sides, this is the essence of destiny or *sunnatullāh*.¹⁰⁹ The concept of *Tawhīd*, if used to resolve the impact of Covid-19 in Indonesia, is the unification of theological pillars in the form of integration between the *Jabāriyyah-Qadāriyyah* views. The cosmic pillar integrates the roles of natural and health sciences such as virology and pharmacology. The cosmic pillar integrates economic, social, cultural and educational sciences. To minimize the negative potential of Covid-19, one must conduct a vaccination program (and booster vaccines)¹¹⁰ and enforcement of health protocols. The positive potential of Covid-19 is that one can maximize through accelerating the development of technology systems and digital industries in Indonesia, humanitarian, national solidarity, the spirit of mutual cooperation, preservation of local wisdom, friendship, the formation of "*Kampung Tangguh*,"¹¹¹ and a more creative and innovative community. Regarding this, President Joko Widodo once said, "Do not let the Covid-19 crisis lead to a setback. We must use the Covid-19 crisis as a momentum to make a big leap."¹¹²

Subsequently, objectification is the movement of reasoning from ideology to science. According to Kunto, objectification is different from objectivation. Objectivation comes from the word "object," so

¹⁰⁸ Wahyudi, Yudian, *Jihad Ilmiah Dua: Dari Harvard ke Yale and Princeton* (Yogyakarta: Pesantren Nawasea Press, 2020), 26.

¹⁰⁹ Saidurrahman, *Rekonstruksi Peradaban Islam Perspektif Yudian Wahyudi*, 116-131.

¹¹⁰ Klugar, M., et al., "Covid-19 Vaccine Booster Hesitancy (VBH) of Healthcare Workers in Czechia: National Cross-Sectional Study," *Vaccines: MDPI* 9(1437) (2021), 2.

¹¹¹ Rakhmadani, Riky, "Strategi Komunikasi Publik Gugus Tugas Covid-19 Dalam Program Kampung Tangguh," *Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi* 3(2) (2020), 29.

¹¹² President Joko Widodo in a State Addressed Speech, August 14, 2020.

objectivation is "seeing something like an object or thing."¹¹³ In some cases, there has been an objectivation process from medical personnel and the public to Covid-19 patients. For example, there is the term "Covid-dized" patient. Objectification comes from the word "objective", which means the act of objectifying, which means "to make something objective." That something becomes objective when its existence does not depend on the subject's mind but stands alone independently.¹¹⁴ Kunto divides objective behavior into two: active and passive objective behavior. Passive objective behavior in the sense of accepting the objective reality presented or already existed in the reality of life, like giving material goods, for example electronics. The second is dynamic objective behavior or objectification, namely behavior to objectify ideas. So, objectification is a behavior or process to objectify an abstract idea be external to the subject's mind. Thus the idea acquires an objective status as an independent entity.¹¹⁵

In this context, objectification is utilization to understand Covid-19 from the perspective of scientists, not religionists. According to virology, the cause of Covid-19 resulted in a new type of coronavirus called the 2019 novel coronavirus (2019-nCoV). This disease belongs to the same virus class as the virus that causes severe acute respiratory syndrome (SARS) and Middle-East respiratory syndrome (MERS).¹¹⁶ One of the government's efforts has made at this time is to intensify

¹¹³ Kuntowijoyo, *Muslim Tanpa Masjid: Esai-Esai Agama, Budaya, dan Politik Dalam Bingkai Strukturalisme Transendental* (Bandung: Miza, 2001), 301.

¹¹⁴ *Ibid.*, 302.

¹¹⁵ Muttaqin, Husnul, "Pemikiran Kuntowijoyo tentang Objektifikasi Islam dan Urgensinya bagi Pengembangan Hukum Islam di Indonesia," Thesis, IAIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, 2001, 31.

¹¹⁶ Vellas, C., et al., "Covid-19, Virology and Geroscience: A Perspective," *J Nutr Health Aging* 24(7) (2020), 685.

the vaccination program.¹¹⁷ The integration between virology and Islamic jurisprudence was evident when the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI) issued Fatwa Number: 02 of 2021 concerning the cleanliness and *halalness* of Covid-19 Vaccine Products from Sinovac Life Science Co. LTD China and PT Bio Farma.¹¹⁸ Apart from virology, another science that can be involved here is pharmacology.

The objectification step involves examining the verses of the al-Qur'ān, which explain the virus as a precautionary step in the future. For example, the verse which means, "Verily Allah does not hesitate to make an illustration of a mosquito or something more than that."¹¹⁹ The word *ba'ūdāh* in Indonesian means 'mosquito', and in English, it means 'the lowest of the creature.' Therefore, it is associated with 'a creature who is very weak and has extraordinary intelligence.' In this regard, the researcher connects the words *ba'ūdāh* (the lowest of creature; a fragile creature and has exceptional intelligence) with the characteristics of viruses, including the coronavirus.¹²⁰ Viruses are weak microscopic creatures that have a size of between 27 nm, for example bacteriophages, up to 300 nm, for example smallpox viruses (1 nm = 10⁻⁹ m = 0.000000001 m), and viruses are very dependent on meeting all the basic needs of living things to survive in

¹¹⁷ Siti Aminah & Susilo, Slamet Rahmat Topo, "State Capacity in Implementing the Covid-19 Vaccination Program in Indonesia," Proceedings of the 2nd Annual Conference on Blended Learning, Educational Technology and Innovation 2021, 67.

¹¹⁸ Rachmadhani, Fajar, "*Wasathiyah*: Theory and Practice in Muhammadiyah Fatwa During The Covid-19 Pandemic," *Profetika: Jurnal Studi Islam* 23(1) (2021), 44.

¹¹⁹ The Qur'ān, al-Baqarah 2:26.

¹²⁰ Wathoni, Lalu Muhammad Nurul & Nursyamsu, "Tafsir Virus (*Fauqa Ba'ūdāh*): Korelasi Covid-19 dengan Ayat-Ayat Allah," *Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an dan Tafsir* 3(1) (2020), 63.

their host cell. Despite this, the virus has an amazing intelligence. One example is the Covid-19 coronavirus.¹²¹

The third area is intersubjective. According to Amin,¹²² the relationship between subject and object is neither subjective (*bayānī*) nor objective (*burhānī*) but rather intersubjective (*irfānī*). Any truth, especially in matters related to socio-religious life, is intersubjective. What is felt by adherents of a particular culture, race, religion, nation-with a slight degree of difference-is also felt by humans in other cultures, races, religions and nations. The term "intersubjective"¹²³ comes from Ian. G. Barbour on intersubjective testability.¹²⁴ With this intersubjective model, Amin initiated "universal humanity"¹²⁵ namely the principle of understanding the existence of people, groups and adherents of other religions (verstehen, understanding others) by cultivating empathy, sympathy, social skills and upholding the principles of universal reciprocity (if you feel pinched, do not pinch others).¹²⁶

¹²¹ Subbarao, Kanta & Mahanty, Siddhartha, "Respiratory Virus Infections: Understanding Covid-19," *Immunity* 52(1) (2020), 906.

¹²² Abdullah, M. Amin, "Islam dan Modernisasi Pendidikan di Asia Tenggara: Dari Pola Pendekatan Dikotomis-Atomistik ke Arah Integratif-Interdisciplinary," Konferensi Internasional Antar Bangsa Asia Tenggara, Universitas Gadjah Mada, December 10-11, 2004, 9.

¹²³ Abdullah, M. Amin, "Intersubjektifitas Keberagaman Manusia: Membangun Budaya Damai Antar Peradaban Manusia melalui Pendekatan Penomenologi Agama", in *Filsafat dan Bahasa dalam Studi Islam*, ed. Ahmad Pattiroy (Yogyakarta: Lembaga Penelitian, 2006), 41.

¹²⁴ Barbour, Ian. G., *Issues in Science and Religion* (London: Harper Torchbooks, 1966), 12.

¹²⁵ Abdullah, M. Amin, "Keimanan Universal di Tengah Pluralisme Budaya: Tentang Klaim Kebenaran dan Masa Depan Ilmu Agama," *The Journal of 'Ulumul Qur'an* 1(2) (1992), 95.

¹²⁶ Abdullah, M. Amin, "Epistemologi Ilmu Pro(f)etik: Apa yang Terlupakan dari Ilmu-ilmu Sekuler," *Sarasehan Ilmu Profetik II* in Court Room A Lt. 5, Graduate School of UGM, July 28, 2011, 14-15.

According to Amin, the resolution of Covid-19 is by collaboration or integrating various disciplines, including religious sciences. Three conditions must exist to achieve the interconnections between religion and science. Firstly, the relationship between the two must penetrate each other (semipermeable), seeping into and communicating with each other. Any scientific discipline must not close itself to other scientific disciplines. Secondly, the application of an intersubjective way of thinking¹²⁷ (intersubjective testability) can reduce the tensions between the subjectivity of religion and the objectivity of science. Thirdly, scientists and religious leaders need to think creatively and imaginatively (creative imagination) in solving various problems of life, including in handling Covid-19.¹²⁸

The fourth area in handling Covid-19 in Indonesia is paying attention to interobjective areas by developing health technology¹²⁹ in a systemic-transdisciplinary manner. To make it happen, the researchers offer the idea of *Khalīfah* (not *Khilāfah*), which Yudian conveyed.¹³⁰ There are two requirements to become a *Khalīfah*: namely

¹²⁷ Scalabrini, Andrea, et al., "What Covid-19 Tells Us about The Self: The Deep Intersubjective and Cultural Layers of Our Brain," *Psychiatry and Clinical Neurosciences* 75(1) (2021), 37.

¹²⁸ Abdullah, M. Amin, *Multidisiplin, Interdisiplin, dan Transdisiplin: Metode Studi Agama dan Studi Islam di Era Kontemporer*, 320-325; Abdullah, M. Amin, "Pengantar: Agama, Sains, dan Covid-19", in *Modul dan Bahan Pelatihan Penelitian Integrasi-Interkoneksi Ilmu: Tesis dan Disertasi*, ed. Riyanto, Waryani Fajar (Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2021), v.

¹²⁹ O'Rourke, B., et al., "The New Definition of Health Technology Assessment: A Milestone in International Collaboration," *International Journal of Technology Assessment in Health Care: Cambridge University Press* 36(1) (2020), 187.

¹³⁰ Wahyudi, Yudian, "*Khalīfah* dan *Khilāfah* dalam Konteks NKRI Berdasarkan Pancasila", presented as an expert at the State Administrative Court (*Pengadilan Tata Usaha Negara/PTUN*) trial in South Jakarta, March 8, 2018.

mastering and having knowledge of *Asmā*¹³¹ and winning the match.¹³² The *Khalīfah* must have the ability to manage *khiḷāf* (mistakes and weaknesses) and *ikhṭilāf* (negative potential). If Covid-19 is considered a *khiḷāf* and *ikhṭilāf*, Indonesia must rise to become a *Khalīfah* on this earth who wins the match against Covid-19. The condition is that Indonesia must prepare the names of professionals in all scientific fields in an integral manner including medical doctors, law graduates, economists, sociologists and religionists. Indonesia must be optimistic to win and become the world's caliph in solving Covid-19 through a transdisciplinary way of thinking and acting.

Conclusion and Discussion

Based on a comparison of the thoughts of Indonesian Muslims represented by Kunto, Amin and Yudian regarding a transdisciplinary policy in handling Covid-19 in Indonesia through Ken Wilber's Universal Integration or Holonic Integration approach, three conclusions have emerged. First, Covid-19 in Indonesia must be a trans-strategical, not just a health and economical approach or an interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary "brake and throttle" approach. One of the strategies for consideration is transdisciplinary.

Second, the transdisciplinary model can utilize the Universal Integration or Holonic Integration pattern.

¹³¹ The names here are science, which later became science and technology. In the context between countries, the names here are military technologies such as submarines, nuclear and bombers. In the civil field, the names here are professional titles such as law degree, bachelor of education and doctor. On the other hand, winning matches here can vary. It could be an inheritance from a predecessor, it could be one man-one vote, it could be acclamation and so on.

¹³² Djidin, M. & Syamsuddin, Sahiron, "Indonesian Interpretation of the Qur'an on *Khiḷāfah*: The Case of Quraish Shihab and Yudian Wahyudi on Qur'an 2: 30-38," *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies* 57(1) (2019), 143.

Universal Integration or Holonic Integration combines four strategies and perspectives in handling Covid-19 in Indonesia, namely the subjective strategy (integration of religious, theological views between *Jabāriyah* [fatalism] and *Qadāriyah* [free will] be related to Covid-19 and the role of religious leaders in promoting Covid-19 prevention in religious places such as mosques and various regions), objectification strategies (contributions to the integration of natural sciences such as virology, pharmacology, medicine, nursing and health), intersubjectification strategies (contributions to the integration of social sciences and humanities) and interobjectification strategies (building health technology in a systemical manner).

Transdisciplinary (policy) model can apply to read and dilute the tensions between the subjective, objective, intersubjective and interobjective areas. For example, the phenomenon of refusing the bodies of positive patients or Patients Under Supervision (*Pasien Dalam Pengawasan/PDP*) Covid-19 is a relationship tension between the objective-intersubjective areas. For example, the phenomenon of strict policies on health protocols and social restrictions that limit economic and religious activity is a relationship tension between objective-interobjective and objective-subjective areas and so on. The government's task is to manage the tensions between the four dimensions through systemic coordination and transdisciplinary policies. The potential solution for Covid-19 pandemic in Indonesia is utilizing the transdisciplinary scientific policy model called "bio-psycho-socio-spiritual" strategies. The "I" quadrant equates with the "psycho" dimension; the "It" quadrant, which can align with the "bio" dimension, and the "Its" and "We" quadrants can align with the "socio" dimension. This quadrant model must equip itself with a "spiritual" dimension.

Kunto has contributed to an objective-subjective way of thinking (the ideologization of Covid-19) and a subjective-objective (the science of Covid-19) in handling Covid-19 in Indonesia. Amin offers an intersubjective thinking model (subjective and objective integration) to handle Covid-19 in Indonesia from social and religious dimensions. Meanwhile, Yudian initiated inter-objective reasoning and the importance of Indonesia becoming a "Khalifah", who could compete against Covid-19 by developing integrated health technology science. The transdisciplinary policy strategy in handling Covid-19 in Indonesia through Kunto, Amin and Yudian, with the framework of Ken Wilber's Four Quadrants theory, is fundamentally linking and combining subjective, objective, intersubjective and interobjective strategies. The fourth Quadrants are fulfilled through the thoughts of the three thinkers in dealing with Covid-19 in Indonesia, which the researchers call "Transdisciplinary Policy."

This transdisciplinary policy in handling the Covid-19 case in Indonesia is then implemented concretely into four types of policy formulation. First is subjective policy, which is Covid-19 handling involving religion, with the inclusion of religious figures, religious organizations and religious assemblies to promote awareness to their members, that Covid-19 is a disaster that calls for the faith of religious people, instead of a curse from God Almighty. Second is objective policy, which calls for Covid-19 handling through scientific involvement, especially in the economy and health sector under the control of the national Covid-19 coping task unit (Satuan Tugas Penanggulangan Covid-19 Nasional). Third is intersubjective policy, where Covid-19 is handled through active involvement of the society at large, for example with the creation of Desa Tangguh (resilient village). Fourth is interobjective policy, where Covid-19 is handled through increasing international cooperation regarding the

Covid-19, such as vaccine procurement in Indonesia and information exchange with updated practices of Covid-19 handling internationally.

References

- ‘Abduh, Muḥammad. *Risālah al-Tawhīd*. Cairo: Al-Manār, 1926.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. "The Idea of Universality of Ethical Norms in Ghazālī and Kant" Dissertation, Turkiye Diyanet Vakfı, 1992.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. "Keimanan Universal di Tengah Pluralisme Budaya: Tentang Klaim Kebenaran dan Masa Depan Ilmu Agama". *Jurnal ‘Ulum al-Qur’an* 1(2) (1992): 1-12.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. *Dinamika Islam Kultural: Pemetaan atas Wacana Keislaman Kontemporer*. Bandung: Mizan, 2000.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. *Rekonstruksi Metodologi Studi Agama-agama dalam Masyarakat Multikultural dan Multireligius: Pidato Pengukuhan Guru Besar Ilmu Filsafat*. Yogyakarta: IAIN Sunan Kalijaga, 2000.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. *Antara Ghazali & Kant: Filsafat Etika Islam*, translated by Hamzah. Bandung: Mizan, 2002.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. *Universalitas Des Ethik Kant & Ghazali*, translated by Yakut, A.. Frankfurt: Verlag Y. Landeck, 2003.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. "Etika Tauhidik sebagai Dasar Kesatuan Epistemologi Keilmuan Umum dan Agama: dari Paradigma Positivistik-Sekularistik ke Arah Teoantroposentrik-Integralistik". In *Menyatukan Kembali Ilmu-ilmu Agama dan Umum: Upaya Mempertemukan Epistemologi Islam dan Umum*, ed. Wahyudi, Jarot. Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2003: 3-23.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. "Islam dan Modernisasi Pendidikan di Asia Tenggara: Dari Pola Pendekatan Dikotomis-

- Atomistik Kearah Integratif-Interdisciplinary." Yogyakarta: Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2004.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. *Islamic Studies di Perguruan Tinggi: Pendekatan Integratif-Interkoneksi*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2006.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. "Intersubjektivitas Keberagaman Manusia: Membangun Budaya Damai Antar Peradaban Manusia Melalui Pendekatan Penomenologi Agama". In *Filsafat dan Bahasa dalam Studi Islam*, ed. Ahmad Pattiroy. Yogyakarta: Lembaga Penelitian, 2006: 1-24.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. *Mempertautkan Ulum al-Diin, al-Fikr al-Islami dan Dirasah Islamiyyah: Sumbangan Keilmuan Islam untuk Peradaban Global*. Yogyakarta: UIN Sunan Kalijaga, 2008.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. *Epistemologi Ilmu Pro(f)etik: Apa yang Terlupakan dari Ilmu-ilmu Sekuler*. Yogyakarta: Sekolah Pascasarjana UGM, 2011.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. *Fresh Ijtihad: Manhaj Pemikiran Keislaman Muhammadiyah di Era Disrupsi*. Yogyakarta: Suara Muhammadiyah, 2019.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. "The Intersubjective Type of Religiosity: Theoretical Framework and Methodological Construction for Developing Human Sciences in a Progressive Muslim Perspective." *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies* 58(1) (2020): 63-101.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. *Multidisiplin, Interdisiplin dan Transdisiplin: Metode Studi Agama dan Studi Islam di Era Kontemporer*. Yogyakarta: IB Pustaka, 2021.
- Abdullah, M. Amin. "Pengantar: Agama, Sains dan Covid-19". In *Modul dan Bahan Pelatihan Penelitian Integrasi-Interkoneksi Ilmu: Tesis dan Disertasi*, ed. Riyanto, Waryani Fajar. Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2021.
- Zainal Abidin, Muhammad. *Paradigma Islam dalam Pembangunan Ilmu Integralistik: Membaca Pemikiran Kuntowijoyo*. Banjarmasin: IAIN Antasari Press, 2016.

- Aditya, Surya. "Tinjauan Kritis terhadap Integrasi Agama dan Sains: Studi Komparatif antara Ian G. Barbour dan Ken Wilber." Thesis, Fakultas Filsafat Universitas Gadjah Mada Yogyakarta, Indonesia, 2021.
- Adin, Azam Hanif, Supriyadi, Djuniadi & Ani Rusilowati. "Preliminary Study of Kuntowijoyo Student Value Assessment Instruments (High School Case Study)." *Indonesian Journal of Education and Learning* 4(2) (2021): 500-507.
- Siti Aminah & Susilo, Slamet Rahmat Topo. "State Capacity in Implementing the Covid-19 Vaccination Program in Indonesia," *Proceedings of the 2nd Annual Conference on Blended Learning, Educational Technology and Innovation*, 2021: 67-72.
- Aminullah, Erman & Erman, Erwiza. "Policy Innovation and Emergence of Innovative Health Technology: The System Dynamics Modelling of Early Covid-19 Handling in Indonesia." *Elsevier: Technology in Society* 66(2) (2021): 1-15.
- Anam, Khoirul ed.. *Mengenal Lebih Dekat Sosok dan Pemikiran Kepala BPIP RI: Prof. Drs. K.H. Yudian Wahyudi, M.A., Ph.D.* Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2021.
- Anam, Khairul. *Salam Pancasila Sebagai Salam Kebangsaan: Memahami Pemikiran Kepala Badan Pembinaan Ideologi Pancasila Yudian Wahyudi.* Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2021.
- Anwar, Wan. *Kuntowijoyo: Karya dan Dunianya.* Jakarta: Grasindo, 2007.
- Arifin, Jainul. "Teologi Humanis dalam Pemikiran M. Amin Abdullah." *Jurnal Refleksi* 20(2) (2020): 119-134.
- Al-‘Asqalānī, Ibn Hājar. *Badhl al-Mā‘ūn fī Faḍl al-Ṭā‘ūn.* Riyadh: Dār al-‘Āšimah, 1991.
- Bagir, Haidar & Ulil Abshar Abdallah. *Sains Religius dan Agama Saintifik: Dua Jalan Mencari Kebenaran.* Bandung: Mizan, 2021.

- Barbour, Ian G.. *Issues in Science and Religion*. New York: Harper Torchbooks, 1966.
- Baxter, R., Jemberie, W. B., Xia, L., Naseer, M., Pauelsen, M., Shebehe, J., Viklund, E. W. E., Xin, X., Zulka, L. E. & Badache, A.. "Covid-19: Opportunities for Interdisciplinary Research to Improve Care for Older People in Sweden." *Scandinavian Journal of Public Health* 1(2) (2021): 29-32.
- Bramastia. "Rasionalisasi Mitologi Covid-19." *Suara Merdeka Solo*, May 12, 2020.
- Brems, L.. *Intersubjectivity and Intersubjectification*. London: The Routledge Handbook of Cognitive Linguistics, 2020.
- Clayton, P., ed. *Toward A Comprehensive Integration of Science and Religion: A Post-Metaphysical Approach*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2006.
- Dein, S., et al.. "Covid-19, Mental Health and Religion: An Agenda for Future Research Mental Health." *Religion & Culture* 23(1) (2020): 1-9.
- Direktorat Pendidikan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam Kementerian Agama RI. *Pedoman Implementasi Integrasi Ilmu di Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam/PTKI*. Jakarta: Kementerian Agama RI, 2019.
- Djidin, M. & Syamsuddin, Sahiron. "Indonesian Interpretation of the Qur'an on Khilāfah: The Case of Quraish Shihab and Yudian Wahyudi on Qur'an 2: 30-38." *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies* 57(1) (2019): 143-166.
- Fahmi, M. *Islam Transendental: Menelusuri Jejak-jejak Pemikiran Islam Kuntowijoyo*. Yogyakarta: Pilar Media, 2005.
- Fathurahman, Oman. "Jangan Takut Corona, Takutlah pada Tuhan: Disebut Justru Tak Sesuai Ajaran Rasul." *Antara News.Com*, May 13, 2020.

- Fukuyama, F.. *The Great Disruption: Human Nature and the Reconstruction of Social Order*. New York: The Free Press, 1999.
- Fukuyama, F.. *Our Posthuman Future: Consequences of the Biotechnology Revolution*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2002.
- ‘Abd. Halim. “Dampak Humaniora Pandemi Covid-19: Apakah Perpres Nomor 82 Tahun 2020 Sebuah Solusi?” In *Hukum Kesehatan dan Inkonsistensi Kebijakan*, ed. ‘Abd. Halim. Yogyakarta: Kreasi Total Media, 2020: 34-40.
- ‘Abd. Halim. *Mismanajemen Kebijakan Kesehatan di Tengah Pandemi*. Yogyakarta: Kreasi Total Media, 2020.
- Ḥanafī, Ḥassan. *Al-Turāth wa al-Tajdīd: Mawqifunā min al-Turāth al-Qadīm*. Cairo: Al-Markāz al-‘Arabī al-Baḥth wa al-Naṣhr, 1980.
- Heikkurinen, P. & Ruuska, T.. *Sustainability Beyond Technology: Philosophy, Critique, and Implication for Human Organization*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2021.
- Hilmy, Masdar & Khoirun Niam. “Winning the Battle of Authorities: The Muslim Disputes Over the Covid-19 Pandemic Plague in Contemporary Indonesia.” *Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies (QIJIS)* 8(2) (2020): 293-326.
- Humām, Muḥammad. *Tadākhul al-Ma‘ārif wa Nihāyat al-Takhaṣṣuṣ fī al-Fikr al-Islāmī al-‘Arabī*. Cairo: Dirāsah fī ‘Alaqaṭ bayn al-‘Ulūm, 2017.
- Hutapea, Riski Munandar., et al.. “Exploring the Strategies of Teachers to Integrate *Tauhid* in Teaching Science and History in Selangor, Malaysia.” *International Journal of Social Learning* 1(2) (2021): 89-102.
- Iqbal, Moch & Adisel. “Epistemology of Islamic Science: A Searching for Ideal Form and Format of Scientific

- Design for Islamic Higher Education in Indonesia." *Madania* 25(1) (2021): 101-112.
- Ita, Kevin. "Coronavirus Disease (Covid-19): Current Status and Prospects for Drug and Vaccine Development." *Archives of Medical Research* 52(1) (2021): 15-24.
- Al-Jābirī, Muhammad Ābid. *Bunyah al-'Aql al-'Arabī: Dirāsah Tahlīliyyah Naqdiyyah li Nadzm al-Ma'rifah fī al-Thaqāfah al-'Arabīyyah*. Beirut: Markāz Dirāsāt al-Wiḥdah al-Murābiyyah, 1986.
- Al-Jābirī, Muhammad Ābid. *Takwīn al-'Aql al-'Arabī*. Beirut: al-Markāz al-Thaqāfi al-'Arabī, 1990.
- Al-Jābirī, Muhammad Ābid. *Al-Turāth wa al-Ḥadāthah: Dirāsāt wa Munāqashāt*. Beirut: Markāz Dirāsāt al-Wahdah al-'Arabīyyah, 1991.
- Jakonen, JP.. *Ken Wilber as a Spiritual Innovator Studies in Integral Theory*. Finland: University of Turku, 2020.
- Klein, J. T.. "Guiding Questions for Integration." *Integration Symposium 2004-Proceeding*. Canberra, Australia: Land and Water, 2008.
- Kaelan. *Metode Penelitian Agama Kualitatif Interdisipliner: Metode Penelitian Ilmu Agama Interkonektif Interdisipliner Dengan Ilmu Lain*. Yogyakarta: Paradigma, 2010.
- Kersten, C.. *Islam in Indonesia: The Contest for Society, Ideas and Values*. London: Hurst & Company, 2015.
- Klugar, M., Riad, A., Mohanan, L. & Pokorná, A.. "Covid-19 Vaccine Booster Hesitancy (VBH) of Healthcare Workers in Czechia: National Cross-Sectional Study." *Vaccines: MDPI* 9(1437) (2021): 2-29.
- Kuntowijoyo. *Paradigma Islam: Interpretasi Untuk Aksi*. Bandung: Mizan, 1992.
- Kuntowijoyo. *Periodisasi Sejarah Kesadaran Keagamaan Umat Islam Indonesia: Mitos, Ideologi dan Ilmu: Pidato Pengukuhan Jabatan Guru Besar Ilmu Sejarah*

- pada Fakultas Ilmu Budaya Universitas Gadjah Mada.*
Yogyakarta: Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2001.
- Kuntowijoyo. *Muslim Tanpa Masjid: Esai-esai Agama, Budaya dan Politik dalam Bingkai Strukturalisme Transendental.* Bandung: Mizan, 2001.
- Kuntowijoyo. *Perubahan Sosial dalam Masyarakat Agraris Madura 1850-1940*, translated by Machmoed Effendhie and Punang Amaripuja. Yogyakarta: Matabangsa, 2002.
- Kuntowijoyo. *Usulan Pendirian Forum Studi Ilmu-ilmu Profetik kepada UGM.* Yogyakarta: n.p., 2002.
- Kuntowijoyo. *Islam Sebagai Ilmu: Epistemologi, Metodologi dan Etika.* Yogyakarta: Tiara Wacana, 2006.
- Leonardi, M., et al.. "Avoiding the Banality of Evil in Times of Covid-19: Thinking Differently with a Biopsychosocial Perspective for Future Health and Social Policies Development." *SN Comprehensive Clinical Medicine* 2(1) (2020): 1758–1760.
- Lippi, G., Sanchis-Gomar, F. & Henry, B. N.. "Covid-19: Unravelling the Clinical Progression of Nature's Virtually Perfect Biological Weapon." *Ann Transl Med* 8(11) (2020): 1-6.
- Machmudi, Y., Supratman, F. R. & Ozay, M.. "Turkish Laicism in Indonesia's Newspapers (1920-1940) and Its Influence on Indonesian Secularists and Muslims Thoughts." *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 15(1) (2021): 1-20.
- Marwazi & Abid, M. H.. "Traditional *Madrasah*, State Policies and the Rise of Integrated Islamic Schools in Jambi." *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 15(1) (2021): 75-101.
- Mascolo, Michael F. & Kallio, E.. "The Phenomenology of Between: An Intersubjective Epistemology for Psychological Science." *Journal of Constructivist Psychology* 33(1) (2020): 1-28.

- Mawdūdī, Sayyid Abū al-A‘lā. *Al-Jihād fī al-Islām*. Beirut: Dār al-Fikr, 1988.
- Mohiuddin, M. D. & Kasahara, K.. "Investigating the Aggressiveness of the Covid-19 Omicron Variant and Suggestions for Possible Treatment Options." *Respiratory Medicine* 191(1) (2022): 1-5.
- Minhaji, Akh. *Agama, Islam dan Ilmu: Visi dan Tradisi Akademik PTAIN/S*. Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2016.
- Mokiy, Vladimir S. & Lukyanova, Tatiana A.. "Covid-19: Systems Transdisciplinary Generalization, Technical and Technological Ideas, and Solutions." *Informing Science: The International Journal of an Emerging Transdiscipline* 25(2) (2022): 1-20.
- Muttaqin, Husnul. "Pemikiran Kuntowijoyo tentang Objektifikasi Islam dan Urgensinya bagi Pengembangan Hukum Islam di Indonesia." Thesis. Yogyakarta: IAIN Sunan Kalijaga, 2001.
- Nageeb, S., et al.. "Adapting a Religious Health Fatalism Measure for Use in Muslim Populations." *Plos One* 2(1) (2018): 1-12.
- Ni'mawati, et al.. "Kajian Riset Monodisipliner dan Interdisipliner dalam Pendidikan Islam Menghadapi Isu Nasional dan Global: Studi Kasus Terhadap Isu Covid-19." *Misykat* 5(1) (2020): 101-122.
- O'Brien, H.. "An Integrated Multidisciplinary Model of Covid-19 Recovery Care." *Irish Journal of Medical Science* 1(2) (2020): 27-40.
- O'Rourke, B., Oortwijn, W. & Schuller, T.. "The New Definition of Health Technology Assessment: A Milestone in International Collaboration." *International Journal of Technology Assessment in Health Care: Cambridge University Press* 36(1) (2020): 187-190.
- Pranita, Ellyvon. "Setahun Pandemi Covid-19: Enam Teori Konspirasi Menyesatkan Dunia." *Kompas*, March 2, 2021.

- Prasetyantoko, A.. "Pandemi, Resesi dan Masa Depan Peradaban". In *Indonesia Menghadapi Pandemi: Kajian Multidisiplin Dampak Covid-19 pada Peradaban*, ed. Prasetyantoko, A. & Suryahudaya, Edbert G.. Jakarta: Kompas, 2020.
- Puspitasari, Fantika F.. "The Integration-Interconnection Discourse of Islamic Education and Science in Indonesia." *Jurnal Tarbawi* 2(8) (2020): 153-162.
- Quigley, M. C., Attanayake, J., King, A. & Prideaux, F.. "A Multi Hazards Earth Science Perspective on the Covid-19 Pandemic: The Potential for Concurrent and Cascading Crises." *Environment Systems and Decisions* 40 (2020): 199–215.
- Rachmadhani, Fajar. "Wasathiyah: Theory and Practice in Muhammadiyah Fatwa during the Covid-19 Pandemic." *Profetika: Jurnal Studi Islam* 23(1) (2021): 43-51.
- Rakhmadani, Riky. "Strategi Komunikasi Publik Gugus Tugas Covid-19 dalam Program Kampung Tangguh." *Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi* 3(2) (2020): 29-40.
- Rakhmat, Muhammad Zulfikar & Tarahita, Dikanaya. *Covid-19 di Indonesia: 19 Catatan Pemikiran tentang Covid-19 di Indonesia dari Perspektif Politik, Ekonomi, Sosial dan Hubungan Internasional*. Yogyakarta: UII Press, 2020.
- Riyanto, Waryani Fajar. "Integrasi-Interkoneksi Profetik: Mempertautkan Pemikiran M. Amin Abdullah dan Kuntowijoyo". In *Islam, Agama-agama dan Nilai Kemanusiaan: Festschrift 60 Tahun Untuk M. Amin Abdullah*, eds. Moch. Nur Ichwan and Ahmad Muttaqin. Yogyakarta: CISForm, 2013: 69-93.
- Riyanto, Waryani Fajar. *Integrasi-Interkoneksi Keilmuan: Biografi Intelektual M. Amin Abdullah, Person, Knowledge, Institution*. Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2013.
- Riyanto, Waryani Fajar. *Universalitas Pancasila Yudian Wahyudi: Percikan Biografi Intelektual, Spiritual, dan Internasional*. Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2021.

- Robinson, F.. "Global Health and the Covid-19 Pandemic: A Care Ethics Approach." *Journal of Global Ethics* 1(2) (2021): 1-13.
- Saidurrahman & Tarigan, Azhari Akmal. *Rekonstruksi Peradaban Islam Perspektif Prof. K.H. Yudian Wahyudi, Ph.D.* Jakarta: Prenada Media Group, 2019.
- Saidurrahman. *Bedah Buku: Mengenal Lebih Dekat Sosok dan Pemikiran Kepala BPIP.* Yogyakarta: UIN Sunan Kalijaga, 2021.
- Salmani, A. & Poornamdarian, T.. "Determinism and Free Will from the Point of View of Theology and Mysticism." *Gawhar-Guya* 15(1) (2021): 1-19.
- Novita Sari & Taat Wulandar. "Grounding the Teachings of Kuntowijoyo as a Prophetic Social Science as an Effort to Counteract Radicalism in Indonesia." *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research* 398: 2nd International Conference on Social Science and Character Educations, Atlantis Press, 2019.
- Scalabrini, A., Xu, J. & Northoff, G.. "What Covid-19 Tells Us about the Self: The Deep Intersubjective and Cultural Layers of Our Brain." *Psychiatry and Clinical Neurosciences* 75(1) (2021): 37-45.
- Schwartz, G. & Russek, L.. "The Challenge of One Medicine: Theories of Health and Eight World Hypotheses." *The Journal of Mind-Body Health* 2(2) (1988): 1-7.
- Setiawan, Iwan. "Pemikiran M. Amin Abdullah: Menuju Pendekatan Keilmuan, dari Integratif ke Interkonektif." *Hermeneia: Jurnal Kajian Islam Interdisipliner* 5(2) (2006): 381-408.
- Shahsavari, S.. et al., "Conspiracy in the Time of Corona: Automatic Detection of Emerging Covid-19 Conspiracy Theories in Social Media and the News." *Journal of Computational Social Science* 3(2) (2020): 279-317.
- Sibawaihi. "Epistemologizing the Islamic Concept of Resurrection in the Hereafter: A Comparative Study

- between al-Ghazālī and Fazlur Rahman." *AFKAR: Journal of 'Aqidah and Islamic Thought* 23(2) (2021): 275-310.
- Simeon, J. O.. "Effect of the Demographic of Covid-19 on Different Countries: Using the USA for Comparism." *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Analysis* 4(2) (2021): 193-201.
- Sofjan, Dicky & Wildan, Muhammad. eds. *Virus, Manusia dan Tuhan: Refleksi Lintas Iman tentang Covid-19*. Yogyakarta: ICRS, 2020.
- Subbarao, Kanta & Mahanty, Siddhartha. "Respiratory Virus Infections: Understanding Covid-19." *Immunity* 52(1) (2020): 1-7.
- Supriatman, Yan Yan. "Pendidikan Pesantren Menurut Cak Nur dan Yudian Wahyudi." *Tajdid: Jurnal Pemikiran Keislaman dan Kemanusiaan* 1(1) (2017): 113-134.
- Suryono, Hassan & Utomo, Bkti. "Development of Pancasila Based on Science and Technology in Building a New World Order Era Pandemic Covid-19." *Advances in Social Science, Education, and Humanities Research: Proceedings of the 1st International Conference of Education, Social, and Humanities (INCESH)*, Atlantis Press, 581, 2021: 173-177.
- Al-Shahrastānī. *Al-Milāl wa al-Nihāl*. Beirut: Dār al-Fikr al-'Arabī, 1997.
- Syarif, Z., Mughni, S. A. & Abd Hannan. "Responses of Pesantrens in Madura Towards the Covid-19 Pandemic." *Journal of Indonesian Islam*, 15(1) (2021): 47-73.
- Al-Shātibī, Abū Ishāq Ibrāhim. *Al-Muwāfaqāt fī Uṣūl al-Sharī'ah*. Beirut: Dār al-Halabī, 1990.
- Ṭālibī, Muhammad. *Ummah al-Wasaṭ: Al-Islām wa Taḥaddiyāt al-Mu'āṣirah*. Tunisia: Ceres, 1996.
- Utomo, Sigit Tri & Mu'anayah, Nur Alfi. "Epistemology of Islamic Education al-Jabiri Perspective of the

- Conservative, Modernist, Neo Modernist Flow and *Burhani-Bayani-Irfani*." *International Journal Ihya' Ulum Al-Din* 22(2) (2020): 162-179.
- Ulanova, A. E.. "Ken Wilber's: Integral Spirituality." *Book Review* (2020): 1-3.
- 'Ulwān, 'Abd Allāh Nāsīh. *Tarbiyyah al-Awlād fī al-Islām*. Solo: Insan Kamil Press, 2012.
- Vellas, C., Delobel, P., Barreto, P. D. S. & Izopet, J.. "Covid-19, Virology and Geroscience: A Perspective." *J Nutr Health Aging* 24(7) (2020): 685-691.
- Visser, F.. "Ken Wilber's Problematic Relationship to Science." *Integral Review* 16(2) (2020): 167-185.
- Wahyudi, Yudian. "Hasbi's Theory of *Ijtihad* in the Context of Indonesian Fiqh." Thesis, Montreal Institute of Islamic Studies, 1993.
- Wahyudi, Yudian. "*Maqāshid asy-Syarī'ah* Sebagai Doktrin dan Metode." *Al-Jami'ah Journal* 58(1) (1995): 1-24.
- Wahyudi, Yudian. "Ali Shari'ati and Bint al-Shati' on Free Will: A Comparison." *Journal of Islamic Studies* 9(1) (1998): 35-45.
- Wahyudi, Yudian. "The Slogan 'Back to the Qur'an and the Sunna': A Comparative Study of the Responses of Hasan Hanafī, Muhammad 'Abid al-Jābirī and Nurcholish Madjid." Thesis, The Institute of Islamic Studies, McGill University, 2002.
- Wahyudi, Yudian. *Islam dan Nasionalisme: Sebuah Pendekatan Maqāshid asy-Syarī'ah: Pidato Ilmiah Dies Natalis UIN Sunan Kalijaga*. Yogyakarta: IAIN Sunan Kalijaga, 2006.
- Wahyudi, Yudian. *Maqāshid asy-Syarī'ah Dalam Pergumulan Politik: Berfilsafat Hukum Islam dari Harvard ke Sunan Kalijaga*. Yogyakarta: Nawesea Press, 2007.
- Wahyudi, Yudian. "Mengapa Ibn Sina Hilang dari Sejarah?" unpublished manuscript.

Waryani, Saefudin, Harsya, "Transdisciplinary Policy in Handling COVID-19 in Indonesia," *Afkar* Special Issue on COVID-19 (2022): 173-220

- Wahyudi, Yudian. *Khalīfah dan Khilāfah dalam Konteks NKRI Berdasarkan Pancasila*. Jakarta Selatan: PTUN, 2018.
- Wahyudi, Yudian. *Jihad Ilmiah Dua: Dari Harvard ke Yale dan Princeton*. Yogyakarta: Pesantren Nawesea Press, 2020.
- Wahyudi, Yudian. "Belajarlah dari Bung Karno dalam Membumikan Pancasila." *News in Portal BPIP*, June 8, 2020.
- Wardani, Agustin K.. *Pengantar Bioteknologi*. Jakarta: UB Press, 2020.
- Wathoni, Lalu Muhammad Nurul & Nursyamsu. "Tafsir Virus (*Fauqa Ba'ūdḥah*): Korelasi Covid-19 dengan Ayat-Ayat Allah." *Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an dan Tafsir* 3(1) (2020): 63-84.
- Wilber, K.. *The Marriage of Sense and Soul: Integrating Science and Religion*. Boston: Shambala Publications, 1998.
- Wilber, K.. *A Theory of Everything: An Integral Vision for Business, Politics, Science, and Spirituality*. Boston: Shambala, 2000.
- Wilber, K.. *Integral Spirituality: A Startling New Role for Religion in the Modern and Postmodern World*. Boston: Shambala, 2006.
- Wiber, K. & Bigelow, C.. *The Pocket Ken Wilber*. Boston: Shambala, 2008.
- Yousfi, N. et al.. "The Covid-19 Pandemic: How to Maintain a Healthy Immune System During the Lockdown: A Multidisciplinary Approach with Special Focus on Athletes." *Journal of Biology of Sport* 37(3) (2020): 211-216.
- Zhang, Y., Cai, X., Fry, C. V., Wu, M. & Wagner, C. S.. "Topic Evolution, Disruption, and Resilience in Early Covid-19 Research." *Springer: Scientometrics* 126(1) (2021): 4225-4253.